

# Concise Minutes – Children, Young People and Education Committee

Meeting Venue:

Committee Room 1 – Senedd

Meeting date: Thursday, 18 October  
2018

Meeting time: 09.20 – 13.10

This meeting can be viewed

on [Senedd TV](#) at:

<http://senedd.tv/en/5099>

## Attendance

Category	Names
Assembly Members:	Lynne Neagle AM (Chair) Dawn Bowden AM Michelle Brown AM Hefin David AM Suzy Davies AM Janet Finch–Saunders AM Llyr Gruffydd AM Julie Morgan AM
Witnesses:	Huw Irranca–Davies AM, Minister for Children, Older People and Social Care Tracy Hull, Welsh Government Owain Lloyd, Welsh Government
Committee Staff:	Llinos Madeley (Clerk) Gareth Rogers (Second Clerk)



Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol  
Cymru

National  
Assembly for  
Wales

	<p>Sarah Bartlett (Deputy Clerk)</p> <p>Sian Thomas (Researcher)</p> <p>Lisa Salkeld (Legal Adviser)</p>
--	--

## 1 Introductions, apologies, substitutions and declarations of interest

1.1 The Chair welcomed Members to the Committee, there were no apologies.

1.2 Under Standing Order 17.24 Hefin David AM declared his daughter benefitted from the Childcare Offer.

## 2 Childcare Funding (Wales) Bill: Stage 2 Proceedings

2.1 In accordance with Standing Order 26.21, the Committee disposed of the following amendments to the Bill:

### Amendment 36 (Suzy Davies)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch-Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
	Julie Morgan	
	Hefin David	
	Llyr Gruffydd	

**Amendment 36 was not agreed. Michelle Brown was not present.**

### Amendment 3 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Lynne Neagle	
	Dawn Bowden	
	Julie Morgan	
	Hefin David	

	Suzy Davies	
	Janet Finch–Saunders	
<b>Amendment 3 was not agreed. Michelle Brown was present but did not vote.</b>		

#### **Amendment 4A (Janet Finch–Saunders)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Michelle Brown	Julie Morgan	
	Hefin David	
	Llyr Gruffydd	
<b>Amendment 4A was not agreed.</b>		

#### **Amendment 4 (Llyr Gruffydd)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 4 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 5 (Llyr Gruffydd) was withdrawn in accordance with Standing 22.66(i)**

#### **Amendment 19 (Janet Finch–Saunders)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
------------------	----------------	----------------

Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<p><b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 19 was not agreed.</b></p>		

#### **Amendment 20 (Janet Finch–Saunders)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<p><b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 20 was not agreed.</b></p>		

#### **Amendment 37 (Suzy Davies)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<p><b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 37 was not agreed.</b></p>		

#### **Amendment 6 (Llyr Gruffydd)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>

Llyr Gruffydd	Lynne Neagle	
	Dawn Bowden	
	Julie Morgan	
	Hefin David	
	Suzy Davies	
	Janet Finch–Saunders	
	Michelle Brown	
<b>Amendment 6 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 11 (Huw Irranca–Davies)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

**Amendment 21 (Janet Finch–Saunders)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Michelle Brown	Julie Morgan	
	Hefin David	
	Llyr Gruffydd	
<b>Amendment 21 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 12 (Huw Irranca–Davies)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 13 (Huw Irranca–Davies)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 14 (Huw Irranca–Davies)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 15 (Huw Irranca–Davies)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 16 (Huw Irranca–Davies)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 7 (Llyr Gruffydd)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Llyr Gruffydd	Lynne Neagle	
	Dawn Bowden	
	Julie Morgan	
	Hefin David	
	Suzy Davies	
	Janet Finch–Saunders	
	Michelle Brown	
<b>Amendment 7 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 17 (Huw Irranca–Davies)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 38 (Suzy Davies)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 38 was not agreed.</b>		

### Amendment 39 (Suzy Davies)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 39 was not agreed.</b>		

### Amendment 18 (Huw Irranca–Davies)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Lynne Neagle	Michelle Brown	
Hefin David	Janet Finch–Saunders	
Julie Morgan	Suzy Davies	
Dawn Bowden		
Llyr Gruffydd		
<b>Amendment 18 was agreed.</b>		

### Amendment 22 (Janet Finch–Saunders)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in</b>		

accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 22 was not agreed.

#### Amendment 23 (Janet Finch–Saunders)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Michelle Brown	Julie Morgan	
	Hefin David	
	Llyr Gruffydd	
<b>Amendment 23 was not agreed.</b>		

#### Amendment 24 (Janet Finch–Saunders)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Michelle Brown	Julie Morgan	
	Hefin David	
	Llyr Gruffydd	
<b>Amendment 24 was not agreed.</b>		

#### Amendment 25 (Janet Finch–Saunders)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	



As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 25 was not agreed.

#### Amendment 8 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch-Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	

As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 8 was not agreed.

#### Amendment 40 (Suzy Davies)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch-Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	

As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 40 was not agreed.

#### Amendment 9 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch-Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	

As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 9 was not agreed.

#### Amendment 41 (Suzy Davies)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch-Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	

As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 41 was not agreed.

#### Amendment 42 (Suzy Davies)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch-Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	

As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 42 was not agreed.

#### Amendment 26 (Janet Finch-Saunders)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch-Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Michelle Brown	Julie Morgan	
	Hefin David	

	Llyr Gruffydd	
<b>Amendment 26 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 27 (Janet Finch–Saunders)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 27 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 28 (Janet Finch–Saunders)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 28 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29 (Janet Finch–Saunders)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	

Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 29 was not agreed.		

#### Amendment 30 (Janet Finch–Saunders)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 30 was not agreed.		

**Amendment 1 (Huw Irranca–Davies)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 2 (Huw Irranca–Davies)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

#### Amendment 43 (Suzy Davies)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 43 was not agreed.		

#### Amendment 31 (Janet Finch–Saunders)

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 31 was not agreed.</b>		

#### **Amendment 10 (Llyr Gruffydd)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 10 was not agreed.</b>		

#### **Amendment 32 (Janet Finch–Saunders)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 32 was not agreed.</b>		

#### **Amendment 33 (Janet Finch–Saunders)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 33 was not agreed.</b>		

#### **Amendment 34 (Janet Finch–Saunders)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 34 was not agreed.</b>		

#### **Amendment 35 (Janet Finch–Saunders)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 35 was not agreed.</b>		

#### **Amendment 44 (Suzy Davies)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 44 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 45 (Suzy Davies) was not moved.**

#### **Amendment 46 (Suzy Davies)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Suzy Davies	Lynne Neagle	
Janet Finch–Saunders	Dawn Bowden	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Michelle Brown	Hefin David	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 46 was not agreed.</b>		

2.2 The Chair confirmed that all sections and schedules of the Bill have been deemed agreed, completing Stage 2 proceedings.

2.3 The Committee agreed to write to the Minister for clarity on who is registered to provide childcare.

### **3 Paper to note**

3.1 The papers were noted.

**3.1 Inquiry into Targeted Funding to Improve Education Outcomes – Welsh Government response to the Committee's report**

**3.2 Letter from the Chair of the Petitions Committee – Petition P-05-821 Reintroduce educational support funding for MEAS and the TES to local authorities**

**3.3 Letter from Owen Smith MP – Related to inconsistencies by WJEC in marking**

**4 Motion under Standing Order 17.42(ix) to resolve to exclude the public from the whole of the meeting on 24 October**

4.1 The Motion was agreed